



Hatfield
CONSULTANTS

Regional Capacity Building Program for Health Risk Management of Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs) in South East Asia



Final Risk Assessment Report for
Sok Pa Loung Case Study Site
Vientiane, Lao PDR

March 2009



Canadian International
Development Agency

Agence canadienne de
développement international





Canadian International
Development Agency

Agence canadienne de
développement international



REGIONAL CAPACITY BUILDING PROGRAM FOR HEALTH RISK MANAGEMENT OF PERSISTENT ORGANIC POLLUTANTS (POPs) IN SOUTH EAST ASIA

FINAL RISK ASSESSMENT REPORT FOR SOK PA LOUNG CASE STUDY SITE, VIENTIANE, LAO PDR

Prepared for:

THE WORLD BANK GROUP
1818 H STREET, NW, WASHINGTON DC,
20433, USA

Prepared by:

HATFIELD CONSULTANTS
SUITE 201 – 1571 BELLEVUE AVENUE
WEST VANCOUVER, BC
V7V 1A6

MARCH 2009

POP1406



TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES.....	v
LIST OF APPENDICES	vi
LIST OF ACRONYMS.....	vii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	ix
DISTRIBUTION LIST	x
1.0 INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 SELECTED SITE	1
1.1.1 Operation and Ownership.....	2
1.1.2 Surrounding Property and Land Use	4
1.1.3 Climate	6
1.1.4 Suspected Contaminants.....	6
1.2 RISK ASSESSMENT OBJECTIVES.....	6
1.3 APPROACH.....	7
2.0 PRELIMINARY DATA COLLECTION	9
2.1 SAMPLING PLAN CONSIDERATIONS	9
2.2 ANCILLARY DATA NEEDS FOR EXPOSURE ASSESSMENT	9
2.3 SAMPLING QUALITY ASSURANCE & QUALITY CONTROL	10
2.4 TYPES OF SAMPLES COLLECTED	11
2.5 SAMPLING SITES	11
2.6 LABORATORY ANALYSIS OF ENVIRONMENTAL SAMPLES.....	12
2.6.1 CALUX Analysis	12
2.6.2 High Resolution Analysis	13
2.6.3 Blood Sample Analysis by AXYS.....	13
2.6.4 Field QA/QC	13
3.0 PROBLEM FORMULATION	15
3.1 PURPOSE OF A PROBLEM FORMULATION	15
3.2 IDENTIFICATION OF CHEMICAL HAZARD.....	16
3.2.1 Characteristics of POPs	16
3.2.2 Screening Contaminant Concentrations Against Guidelines	16
3.3 IDENTIFICATION OF RECEPTORS.....	21
3.4 IDENTIFICATION OF PATHWAYS.....	24
3.5 CONCEPTUAL EXPOSURE MODEL.....	25
4.0 EXPOSURE ASSESSMENT.....	29
4.1 IDENTIFICATION OF DATA FOR EXPOSURE MODELING.....	31
4.2 INPUT TABLE	33
4.3 VARIABLE ENTRY INTO MODEL	36

5.0	HAZARD ASSESSMENT AND RISK CHARACTERIZATION	37
5.1	SELECTING A TOXICITY REFERENCE VALUE (TRV).....	37
5.2	MODELING RESULT	37
5.3	RISK CHARACTERIZATION FOR CARCINOGENS.....	38
5.4	BLOOD ANALYSIS.....	40
5.5	DISCUSSION	41
5.5.1	Modeled Exposures	41
5.5.2	Blood Analysis	43
5.6	UNCERTAINTY AND ASSUMPTIONS	44
6.0	PATH FORWARD TO RISK MANAGEMENT.....	46
6.1	EXISTING MANAGEMENT PLAN.....	46
6.2	SETTING RISK REDUCTION GOALS FOR THE SITE	47
6.2.1	Goals	48
6.2.2	Sub-goals and Indicators.....	48
6.2.3	Proposed Indicators.....	49
6.3	PROPOSED MANAGEMENT MEASURES.....	51
6.4	RECOMMENDING RISK MANAGEMENT ALTERNATIVES.....	53
6.5	IMPLEMENTATION PLANNING	55
6.6	RISK COMMUNICATION	56
7.0	SUMMARY	58
8.0	REFERENCES.....	61
9.0	CLOSURE.....	63

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	Major land use classes within 1 km radius from the SPL site.....	5
Table 1.2	Risk Assessment Design for the SPL Site, Lao PDR.	7
Table 2.1	List of Samples Collected, SPL Site, Lao PDR.....	11
Table 3.1	Concentrations of PCDD/F & PCB TEQs in soils and sediments using CALUX, SPL site, Lao PDR.	19
Table 3.2	Concentrations of Chlorinated Pesticides in fish tissue for screening, SPL site, Laos.	20
Table 3.3	Potential Human receptors related to the SPL site (within 1km radius) may include:.....	21
Table 3.4	Key Demographic Characteristics of Lao PDR.	21
Table 4.1	Contaminant concentration data needs for each exposure scenario.	32
Table 4.2	HR-GCMS analysis results for PCBs and PCDD/F.	32
Table 4.3	Contaminant concentrations to be used in the exposure model.....	33
Table 4.4	Exposure model input table, SPL site, Laos PDR.	35
Table 5.1	Results of Risk Characterization for Non-Carcinogens, SPL site, Lao PDR.	38
Table 5.2	Results of Risk Characterization for Carcinogens, SPL site, Lao PDR.	39
Table 5.3	Blood PCBs concentrations of EDL employees and family members (pg/g lipid), SPL case study, Vientiane, Laos PDR.....	40
Table 5.4	Background Blood PCB concentrations (pg TEQ/g lipid, WHO1998, ½ DL).	43
Table 6.1	Examples of Goals, sub-goals and indicators for the SPL case study site, Vientiane, Lao PDR.	50
Table 6.2	Risk Management Options retained from the qualitative screening, SPL site, Lao PDR.	51

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1	Location of selected SPL site, Vientiane, Lao PDR.....	2
Figure 1.2	Location of SPL Site in Vientiane and its immediate vicinity.	3
Figure 1.3	Management structure of SPL Site, Vientiane.....	4
Figure 1.4	Land Use Map of the SPL Site, Vientiane, Lao PDR.....	5
Figure 2.1	Map of sampling location at SPL site, Vientiane, Lao PDR.	12
Figure 3.1	Vulnerability Map illustrating key buildings for human receptors in the area of SPL Site, Vientiane, Lao PDR.	22
Figure 3.2	Potential receptors associated with the SPL site, Vientiane, Lao PDR.	23
Figure 3.3	Photographs of selected potential exposure pathways associated with the SPL site, Vientiane, Lao PDR.	25
Figure 3.4	Conceptual exposure model for workshop employees, SPL site, Lao PDR.	26
Figure 3.5	Conceptual exposure model for employees' family, SPL site, Lao PDR.	26
Figure 3.6	Conceptual exposure model for local residents, SPL site, Lao PDR.	27
Figure 3.7	Conceptual exposure model for child attending local school, SPL site, Lao PDR.....	27
Figure 3.8	Conceptual exposure model for aquatic receptors, SPL site, Lao PDR.	28
Figure 4.1	Equations used in the Exposure Assessment.	29
Figure 4.2	Screenshot - data entry into the Exposure Assessment component of the Risk Assessment tool.	36
Figure 5.1	Blood PCBs concentrations (homologues) of EDL employees and family members (pg/g lipid), SPL case study, Vientiane, Laos PDR.	41
Figure 6.1	Potential Risk and its major components.....	48

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A1 List of Samples Collected and Analyzed

Appendix A2 Tables of analytical chemistry results

Appendix A3 Raw Chemical Data

Appendix A4 Parameterization of Risk Assessment Model

LIST OF ACRONYMS

CALUX	Chemically Activated Luciferase Gene Expression
CCME	Canadian Council of Ministers for the Environment
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
COC	Chain of Custody (form)
COPC	Contaminants of Potential Concern
EDL	Electricite du Lao
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
ERI	Environmental Research Institute (Lao PDR)
GCMS	Gas Chromatography Mass Spectroscopy
GIS	Geographic Information System
HCH	Hexachloro Cyclo Hexane
HHRA	Human Health Risk Assessment
HPT	Hatfield POPs Project Team
HQ	Hazard Quotient
HR GCMS	High Resolution Gas Chromatography – Mass Spectrometry
ILCR	Incremental Lifetime Cancer Risk
IR	Intake Rate
LE	Years Of Exposure
NC	National Consultant
NFP	National Focal Point for POPs
NIP	National Implementation Plan
PCBs	Polychlorinated Biphenyls
PCDDs	Polychlorinated dibenzodioxins or Dioxins
PCDFs	Polychlorinated dibenzofurans or Furans
PF	Problem Formulation
PIP	Project Implementation Plan
POPs	Persistent Organic Pollutants
POPs Project	Regional Capacity Development Program for Management of Health Risks of Persistent Organic Pollutants in South East Asia
PTS	Persistent Toxic Substances
QA/QC	Quality Assurance / Quality Control

RA/RM	Risk Assessment/Risk Management
RBCs	Risk Based Concentration
SF	Cancer Slope Factor
SOPs	Standard Operation Procedures
SPL	Sok Pa Loung EDL Site
TCDD	Tetrachlorodibenzo-P-Dioxin
TCDF	Tetrachlorodibenzofuran
TDI	Tolerable Daily Intake
TEF	Toxic Equivalence Factor (equivalence to 2,3,7,8-TCDD)
TEQ	Toxic Equivalence Quotient
TRV	Toxicity Reference Value
USEPA	United States Environmental Protection Agency
WREA	Water Resources and Environment Administration
WRERI	Water Resources and Environment Research Institute
XDS	Xenobiotic Detection Systems Inc.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Hatfield Consultants and the POPs Project Team express our sincere thanks to the many individuals who have played significant roles to date in the Regional Capacity Development Program for Management of Health Risks of Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs) in South East Asia (hereafter referred to as the POPs Project).

Special thanks are due to the World Bank Project Task Team, including Dr. Jitendra (Jitu) Shah, Dr. Catalina Marulanda and Manuel Cocco, for their support and assistance with all aspects of project implementation. We would also especially like to thank the Canadian International Development Agency's (CIDA) POPs Fund, for their financial support for the POPs Project.

We would also like to thank Mme Monemany Nhoibouakong, Director General of Water Resources and Environment Research Institute (WRERI), Water Resources and Environment Administration (WREA) for her strong support and guidance. Our sincere thanks also go to all the POPs Team of Lao PDR, Department of Chemicals, Ministry of Defense, and the management of the Sok Pa Loung EDL Transformer Repair Workshop for their technical contributions and positive collaboration, which ultimately led to the success in the case study development.

Our sincere thanks also go to all national counterpart staff, and all relevant national agencies for their active support and invaluable contributions to the POPs Project. We especially thank the participants of the National Training Workshop organized in Vientiane, Lao PDR, from 28-31 January 2009 for their valuable comments and suggestions for finalizing the present Risk Assessment for the Electricite du Laos (EDL) Sok Pa Luang site. Our special thanks go to Mr. Souphone Sengthep, Assistant Manager, EDL Sok Pa Loung Transformer Repair Workshop for hosting the study tour to the site and providing valuable information about the site to the participants.

DISTRIBUTION LIST

The following individuals/firms have received this final document:

Name	Firm	Hardcopies	CDs	FTP
Jitendra Shah	World Bank	✓	✓	✓
Catalina Marulanda	World Bank	✓	✓	✓
Manuel Cocco	World Bank	✓	✓	✓
Monemany Nhoybouakong	NFP Lao PDR	✓	✓	✓